



**Economic and Social
Council**

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/24
26 June 2003

Original: ENGLISH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
Sub-Commission on the Promotion and
Protection of Human Rights
Fifty-fifth session
Item 5 of the provisional agenda

PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION

Discrimination based on work and descent

**Expanded working paper submitted by Mr. Asbjørn Eide and Mr. Yozo Yokota
pursuant to Sub-Commission decision 2002/108***

* The reason for the late submission of this report is the need to allow for additional consultations. The annex is circulated in the language of submission only.

CONTENTS

	<i>Paragraphs</i>	<i>Page</i>
Introduction	1 - 9	3
I. SOME AFFECTED COMMUNITIES OUTSIDE OF ASIA	10 - 43	4
A. Endogamous occupational groups in West Africa (blacksmiths, potters, <i>griots</i> , etc).....	10 - 14	4
B. Groups in North-East Africa (the Dime and others).....	15 - 19	5
C. The Watta: former hunter-gatherers of North-East Africa	20 - 24	6
D. Somali <i>sab</i> groups (Midgan-Madibhan, Tumul and Yibir).....	25 - 30	6
E. <i>Akhdam</i> of Yemen	31 - 34	7
F. <i>Osu</i> of Igboland	35 - 40	7
G. Diaspora communities (especially the South Asian, West African, Somali and Japanese diaspora communities)	41	8
H. Ethnic minorities discriminated against on the grounds of work and descent	42 - 43	8
II. COMMON FEATURES OF DIFFERENT CASES OF DISCRIMINATION BASED ON WORK AND DESCENT	44 - 47	9
A. Causal factors.....	45 - 51	9
B. Consequences	52 - 56	11
III. CONCLUSIONS	57 - 58	12
IV. RECOMMENDATIONS	59 - 66	12
Annex		
Selected bibliography		15

Introduction

1. At its fifty-second session the Sub-Commission for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights in resolution 2000/4 declared that discrimination based on work and descent is a form of discrimination prohibited by international human rights law, and decided to entrust Mr. Rajendra Kalidas Wimala Goonesekere with the task of preparing, without financial implications, a working paper on the topic in order:

(a) To identify communities in which discrimination based on work and descent continues to be experienced in practice;

(b) To examine existing constitutional, legislative and administrative measures for the abolition of such discrimination; and

(c) To make any further concrete recommendations and proposals for the effective elimination of such discrimination as may be appropriate in the light of such examination.

2. At its fifty-third session, the Sub-Commission received and discussed the working paper (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2001/16) submitted by Mr. Goonesekere in accordance with the above mandate. In that working paper, Mr. Goonesekere noted that:

“The focus of this paper has been countries in Asia. At the time the resolution was discussed in the Sub-Commission it was mentioned [that] the problem was not limited to Asia alone and that it existed in some parts of Africa and perhaps in South America. The author has not been able to include in this paper the situation in these other areas because of constraints of time and lack of access to relevant material.”

3. In its decision 2001/110, the Sub-Commission decided to entrust Mr. Goonesekere with the preparation of an expanded working paper on the topic of discrimination based on work and descent in other regions of the world.

4. At its fifty-fourth session, in view of the fact that Mr. Goonesekere was not re-elected to the Sub-Commission and was therefore unable to fulfil the mandate entrusted to him, the Sub-Commission adopted decision 2002/108, in which it decided to entrust Mr. Asbjørn Eide and Mr. Yozo Yokota with the preparation of the expanded working paper.

5. The present report, which should be seen as a supplement to and be read together with Mr. Goonesekere's original working paper, is submitted in accordance with that decision.

6. The type of discrimination which this expanded working paper is intended to examine is identified by reference to two concepts: “work” and “descent”.

7. “Work” is understood in this context as referring to the occupation or functional role of individuals or groups. “Descent” refers to lineage or family origin. The essence of the mandate for this expanded working paper relates to forms of discrimination that find their basis in the combination of the two elements of “work” and “descent”. The concept of “caste” and discrimination related to caste are obviously relevant in this context. However, the meaning and application of the term “caste” is highly contested. While there is no doubt that social institutions in respect of which the term “caste” is applicable fall under the term “descent”, and

that therefore discrimination arising from such social institutions falls under the definition of “racial discrimination”, the term “descent” is wider and can encompass other situations, as discussed in the present paper.

8. Racial discrimination as defined in article 1 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination includes distinctions, exclusions, restrictions or preferences based on descent. As repeatedly pointed out by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), discrimination based on “descent” includes discrimination against members of communities based on forms of social stratification such as caste and analogous systems of inherited status which nullify or impair their equal enjoyment of human rights. The adoption on 22 August 2002 by CERD of General Recommendation XXIX on descent-based discrimination provides a helpful tool for better understanding the meaning of “descent” in this context, and lists measures which should be taken by States to bring such discrimination to an end.

9. The main purpose of this paper is to identify communities, other than those traditionally referred to as “castes” in the South Asian context, in which discrimination based on work and descent continues to be experienced in practice. The preparation of this paper has been based on an examination of available secondary and primary sources, but time and resources have not permitted a more comprehensive review of the global situation with regard to discrimination based on work and descent. In particular, the authors have not been able to conduct a proper review of the existing constitutional, legislative and administrative measures for the abolition of such discrimination. Nor have they been able, for reasons of time, to enter into dialogue with States about this matter. These gaps in the current expanded working paper should be particularly emphasized in any study or other further examination of this question. The “further concrete recommendations and proposals for the effective elimination of such discrimination” which the authors are in a position to make in this expanded working paper are therefore extremely limited, but much of the gap in that respect has been filled by the adoption of the General Recommendation XXIX by CERD.

I. SOME AFFECTED COMMUNITIES OUTSIDE OF ASIA

A. Endogamous occupational groups in West Africa (blacksmiths, potters, *griots*, etc.)

10. The sources show that endogamous groups of artisans and musicians are found in over 15 ethnic groups¹ and at least 14 modern States² in West Africa, making up between 5 per cent and 20 per cent of the relevant populations. They include metalworkers (or “blacksmiths”), potters, musicians/bards (or “*griots*”), leatherworkers, weavers, barbers/hairdressers and others. Membership of such groups is by ascription (i.e. by birth).

11. A number of the available sources remark upon the ambivalent social position of many of these groups. Often they are considered by the non-specialist majority as being “dirty” or “impure”, though the functions they perform are often highly valued or even regarded as indispensable. They are in some cases regarded in traditional societies as having special power, associated with their ability to transform materials such as ore and clay. Their “power” is considered potentially dangerous to others. They often have important religious or quasi-religious ritual roles, particularly in ceremonies associated with life cycle events. In some

cases, the power and/or impurity of members of these groups is considered to be polluting to other people, especially in the case of groups that have ritual roles associated with death and burial.

12. Due to the mix of awe and contempt in which these groups are generally held, endogamy is a common and basic principle in such societies. Other members of the societies in which such groups are found commonly avoid sharing food with or entering the compounds of members of such groups, let alone having sexual intercourse with or marrying them.

13. Because of these differentiations, members of such groups often consider themselves, and are considered by others, as belonging to a separate “race” or “races”. Many myths concerning the origin of such groups either suggest descent from “foreigners” (typically conquered or absorbed ethnic groups) or describe ancestral food transgressions or misfortune.

14. A number of authorities (including Mbow (2000) and Kaba (1997)) have described the continuing salience of stereotypes associated with descent from such groups in modern social and political life in the region, and have analysed the consequences in terms of discrimination and the violation of human rights.

B. Groups in North-East Africa (the Dime and others)

15. The literature reveals that a number of populations in North-East Africa, particularly in southern Ethiopia, exhibit similar features of social organization and discrimination based on work and descent.

16. The Dime people of south-west Ethiopia have especially been highlighted by Todd (1977) for their division into ranked “castes”, with the chief and priests “castes” being considered “pure”, commoners “non-pure” and ritual servants, hunters, smiths and tanners “impure”. Membership of these groups or “castes” is by birth, and they are ideologically endogamous. Endogamy is most strictly observed against the “impure” groups. The two “pure” groups are considered to have privileged access to the gods and spirits. The polluting propensity of the “impure” groups is quite marked, with the passage of a blacksmith through a field being sufficient to pollute the crop.

17. Even authorities who dispute the application of the term “caste” to societies in this region (notably Pankhurst (1999)) have remarked on the strength of social ostracism and endogamous isolation of occupationally specialized groups, such as blacksmiths, potters and hunters, and on the prevalence of notions of purity and pollution in different ethnic groups in the region. Where they exist as a specialized endogamous group, hunters are said to be the most despised; they are differentiated from other marginalized craft groups, and may even be considered sub-human. However, like the endogamous artisan groups of West Africa, the status of craft specialist groups in north-eastern Africa is also said to be ambiguous, ambivalent or even dual - in that they may be despised, ostracized and feared yet they often simultaneously play important social and ritual roles in events such as birth, circumcision, initiation, marriages and funerals.

18. Myths of origin of the marginalized craft specialist groups of this region often associate them with nature and the wild, and even in extreme cases describe them as being descended from unions with animals. Such an association is described by some authorities as representing an

obvious form of social distancing and an ideological legitimation of oppression. Other origin myths tend to portray hunting groups as autochthonous and craft groups as migrants. Still other stories ascribe the marginalized status of such groups to an ancestral curse resulting from a food transgression or other social or religious wrongdoing. Such myths provide a quasi-religious justification for marginalization.

19. At present, information is not available to the authors of this paper on the strength, outside of the traditional community settings, of stereotypes associated with descent from such groups. However, based on the experience of similar groups in the West African region, it seems reasonable to infer that such stereotypes are likely to persist.

C. The Watta: former hunter-gatherers of North-East Africa

20. Generally regarded as being part of the Borana or Gabre peoples of North-East Africa, the Watta - or Waata Oromo - are a group of (former) hunter-gatherers. Watta groups are scattered throughout northern Kenya, central and western Ethiopia, and the northern part of the United Republic of Tanzania.

21. The dominant pastoralist communities of the Borana and Gabre tend to marginalize and ostracize the Watta on the basis of their traditional occupational specialization as hunter-gatherers. The Watta are regarded as being impoverished (since they lack livestock or land). With the ban on hunting (since 1977 in Kenya and since 1996 in Ethiopia) they have been reduced to marginal and socially devalued occupations such charcoal-burning, supplying firewood and building poles, and begging.

22. Perceptions of the poverty of the Watta are also mixed with attitudes of impurity and pollution. Some elders of the Watta community say that they are considered "impure" by others as a result of their ancestors having hunted and eaten "dirty" animals such as porcupines and tortoises. By way of contrast, the dominant Borana group is known as Borana Gutu ("pure").

23. A strong social proscription exists against intermarriage with members of the Watta community.

24. However, like other marginalized groups mentioned above, the Watta are said to play an important and valued role as ritual specialists in the life-cycle ceremonies of the dominant groups.

D. Somali *sab* groups (Midgan-Madibhan, Tumul and Yibir)

25. Somali society is described as being divided into patrilineal segmented and ranked clan groups. "*Sab*" is the collective term for "low-caste" occupationally specialized groups within Somali society, known as Midgan (or Madhiban), Tumul and Yibir. Together, the *sab* groups are only a small minority, believed to be less than 1 per cent of the population.

26. The Tumul are traditionally blacksmiths. The Yibir and Midgan are traditionally both hunters and leatherworkers. Midgan women also performed female circumcision and acted as midwives to the dominant Somali clans.

27. The occupations of the *sab* groups are generally regarded as polluting, and the members of such groups are consequently considered by other Somalis as having become impure. These attitudes may also be related to the fact that the hunting activities of some of these groups involved the killing and eating of animals outside the Shariah precepts on slaughtering. The *sab* groups are also feared and avoided due to the fact that they have a reputation for occult practices.

28. As a result, intermarriage and commensality between the *sab* groups and the main Somali clans is rare. Members of the *sab* groups are not usually allowed to live in villages, to drink or get water from “pure” wells or to use the plates, cups or utensils of the noble clans’ people.

29. Some members of the Midgan and Yibir held important official posts under the Barre regime, and supported the regime in the civil war. As a result, Midgan-Madhiban were reportedly subjected to reprisals by rebel movements when the Barre regime fell in 1991, and are said to continue to suffer active discrimination.

30. There are reports that some Somali asylum-seekers falsely claimed to be Midgan-Madibhan, or members of other *sab* groups, in order to enhance the prospects of success in their applications. However, it is also reported that members of *sab* groups in the Somali refugee diaspora continue to suffer discrimination from members of other Somali clans.

E. Akhdam of Yemen

31. The term *akhdam* means “servants” (singular *khadim*). They are believed to number approximately 200,000 in Yemen today. Their origins are popularly traced to Abyssinian (Ethiopian) soldiers who invaded Yemen in the sixth century.

32. The typical *akhdam* occupational roles are the most menial and dirtiest tasks, including garbage collection, street sweeping, and cleaning toilets and drains. They are often referred to generically as “sweepers”.

33. They are widely regarded as being dirty, immoral, and dependent. They rank even lower in Yemeni society than (ex-)slaves. They generally live in separate shanty settlements, and intermarriage and socialization with them is strongly socially proscribed.

34. According to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Yemen, the “low social status of this group stems from their occupation as well as their [reputed] ethnic origins”.³ Hashem (1996) states that:

“Most researchers are unable to explain why the exclusion of the *akhdam* has been carried on from one generation to another; they believe that this is not based on racial discrimination. There are other Yemenis of African descent, including descendants of slaves, that are fully integrated in Yemeni society ... Nonetheless, social and economic exclusion of the *akhdam* seems to continue as a hereditary trait.”⁴

F. Osu of Igboland

35. In traditional Igbo society, the Osu were ritual servants whose ascribed occupational role was to assist the high priests in the service of the shrines. Osu status was acquired through the

ritual transformation of a Diala (“freeborn”) as a punishment for certain offences, by entering the shrine (whether under duress or voluntarily), by contact with an Osu, or by birth to Osu parents.

36. Interactions between Diala and Osu were strictly regulated, out of fear of and respect for the deities the Osu served. Intermarriage, commensality (“inter-dining”) and any other direct contact with an Osu was forbidden. It was also forbidden for a Diala to spill the blood of an Osu. Anyone breaching these rules would themselves become an Osu.

37. Nwaka (1985) records the history of the Osu abolition movement in the 1930s-1950s, culminating in 1956 in the passage of the “Abolition of Osu System” law by the Eastern Regional House of Assembly (under the colonial administration).

38. The few available sources emphasize the continuing salience of the stigma acquired by birth into an Osu lineage, or by intermarriage or intimate contact with an Osu descendant.

39. Dike (2002) places particular emphasis on the continuing “untouchability” of Osu descendants, and on the social proscription against intermarriage or sexual relations with an Osu descendant. Dike also describes the political disenfranchisement of Osu descendants, and instances of violent attacks against Osu communities.

40. Recent reports in the popular press in Nigeria also tend to confirm the persistence of prejudice and discrimination against Osu descendants.⁵

G. Diaspora communities (especially the South Asian, West African, Somali and Japanese diaspora communities)

41. The authors have not been able, in the time available, to examine in detail the question of discrimination on the basis of work and descent in diaspora communities around the world. However, it is apparent from the previous working paper and from some of the sources reviewed in the course of preparation of this expanded working paper that this is an area in which significant attention needs to be paid. The sources presently available to the authors do indicate the persistence of discrimination based on work and descent in at least some South Asian, West African, Somali and Japanese diaspora communities. To the extent that that is the case, a number of additional Governments, other than those of the regions and countries mentioned in this expanded working paper or in the original working paper, may have responsibilities to address the issue of discrimination based on work and descent. This issue requires further research.

H. Ethnic minorities discriminated against on the grounds of work and descent

42. This expanded working paper, by virtue of the mandate given by the Sub-Commission, could address the situation of ethnic minorities in cases where discrimination against them is attributed not only to their ethnicity but also to the work in which members of the group engage. Some marginalized ethnic minorities tend to have favoured occupations because of their history, culture, tradition, or ways of life. For example, in some countries (in particular in Eastern Europe), Roma/Sinti/Travellers are often found in occupations associated with arts and music. However, whether this occupational specialization of Roma/Sinti/Travellers is a

contributing factor to their discrimination and marginalization is questionable. Their occupational roles do not seem to be defined by birth or associated with their descent in the same way as the other groups described in the original working paper and this expanded working paper. This question should be examined more closely in any further work on this topic.

43. Some of the available sources do seem to indicate the presence of internal “caste-like” divisions within Roma/Sinti groups.⁶ This matter also warrants further research.

II. COMMON FEATURES OF DIFFERENT CASES OF DISCRIMINATION BASED ON WORK AND DESCENT

44. Even a relatively cursory review of the literature and other available sources concerning the communities mentioned in this expanded working paper and the original working paper gives the striking impression of similarity. The authors offer the following tentative analysis of what appear to be the main points of similarity in the causes and expressions of marginalization affecting these diverse communities. Though this analysis is divided into causal factors and consequences, it is apparent that there is considerable overlap and interplay between these elements.

A. Causal factors

Descent: group membership by birth

45. In all of these cases, descent is a defining criterion for the ascription of marginalized status and associated discrimination. Membership of the marginalized group is acquired by birth into that group or by descent from that lineage (although in the case of the Osu other means of acquiring that status existed in the past). The marginalized status so acquired cannot be removed by individual merit or achievement, though it may, depending upon the social circumstances, be concealed if one’s lineage is not known - since the status is not generally or exclusively associated with observable physical characteristics.

Work: occupational specialization, or other connection with type of work or functional role

46. The second principal causal factor is work or occupation (though the ascription of occupational role in these cases may also be seen as consequential upon descent). In each case, the marginalized status and associated discrimination is strongly associated with the occupations (or traditional occupational roles) of the groups concerned. Those occupations (or traditional occupational roles) are typically regarded by other members of the society as dirty and/or menial. The effect is sometimes residual, since the members of the marginalized groups may not in fact continue to carry out those particular kinds of work. In some cases the marginalization/discrimination is associated with a (past) ritual or religious role involving dangerous occult “power”. Even where the original occupational roles no longer exist, the marginalization caused by association with stigmatized traditional occupations may lead - as a consequence - to members of the affected groups being relegated to the most menial jobs, whether or not those jobs are related to the original occupational roles.

Endogamous isolation

47. Endogamous isolation is the precursor of group membership by birth, and so can be seen as a cause of this form of marginalization/discrimination. However, it is also and more usually seen as a consequence, with the social proscription of intermarriage with the marginalized groups being the result of the stigmatization of these groups.

Pollution/purity

48. The notion of pollution (if not always of its polar opposite, purity) is a very common feature of attitudes towards the communities concerned. This is often associated with beliefs regarding the physical dirtiness and/or ritually polluting nature of the ascribed functional roles of these communities (and hence can be seen as a consequence as well as a cause of this form of discrimination). The members of such communities are generally regarded as themselves being sources of potential pollution to others. In other cases, the attitude is related instead to beliefs regarding the potential danger to others of the occult “power” wielded by members of the communities concerned, especially where their ascribed roles have ritual or religious significance (particularly when associated with death and burial).

Hierarchical ranking

49. In most of the cases described, some form of hierarchical ranking is explicit or implicit in the social structure concerned. This may take the form of the complex rank relationships of the jatis of India, or the simple division between “pure” (or “non-pure”) and “impure” in some African groups. However, it should be noted that even in the hierarchical ranking of the caste system of India, rank relationships between individual jatis may not always be clear and may even change over time. And the hierarchical consequences implied by the “pure”/“impure” division in some other societies may often be ambiguous and ambivalent.

Religious sanction and myths

50. While in the case of the caste system of South Asia, there is a strong association with Vedic prescriptions in Hinduism, it is less clear in other cases whether there is a link between religious traditions and descent-based discrimination. In the case of discrimination against the Burakumin of Japan, associations have been made with Shinto beliefs concerning purity and impurity, and with Buddhist precepts and practices.⁷ In the cases of the marginalized African groups described herein, the sanction or justification is based on myths (involving, for example, food transgressions or other ancestral wrongdoing or misfortune), and/or related to the (present or former) ritual or religious function of the groups concerned.

Perceived “racial”/ethnic differences

51. In many cases, popular beliefs ascribe to the groups concerned a different “racial” or ethnic origin from that of the dominant community (though this ascription is in most cases very dubious as a matter of fact). Typically, such beliefs regard the marginalized groups as being descended from conquered or absorbed peoples (as in beliefs regarding the Dalits of India as remnants of the Dravidians displaced in the Aryan invasions, regarding the Burakumin as descendants of indigenous populations of Japan, or regarding the Abyssinian origins of the

akhdam of Yemen), as being descended from migrants (as in the case of some of the endogamous craft specialist groups of Africa, or as in the Korean migration theory of Burakumin origins), or otherwise emphasize a different “racial” or ethnic lineage.

B. Consequences

Segregation in housing/residence

52. As a consequence of the endogamous and social isolation of the affected communities, segregation in housing and residence is relatively common in the cases described, at least in rural or traditional communities. The areas and housing conditions of the affected groups are typically among the poorest and least well serviced. In some cases, segregation in housing and residence may also be seen as a causal factor. In the case of the Burakumin, for example, residence in one of the prescribed Buraku areas is a key criterion for identifying (and hence for discriminating against) Burakumin.

Other forms of social segregation - especially in intermarriage, commensality, and access to public places and services

53. Other forms of segregation are obvious and very common expressions of the discrimination against members of the groups described. The social prohibition against intermarriage with members of these groups is an obvious form of social segregation which is closely associated with the endogamous isolation described above as a causal factor. Restrictions/prohibitions on commensality are also common, with social avoidance of sharing food, drink and utensils with members of the marginalized groups being closely associated with perceptions of the pollution of such groups (and their propensity to pollute). For the same reason, segregation commonly takes place in terms of access to public places and services, including public wells and other water sources, public eating places, and places of worship.

Aspects of social integration (e.g. in protected divisions of labour, or in valued ritual roles)

54. In some respects, certain aspects of these forms of social organization can be said to promote social integration - at least in their original traditional forms. This might be said to be the case in respect of the division of labour entailed in hereditary occupational specialization, protecting members of those groups from competition in those spheres of economic activity by members of other groups. It might also be said in relation to the valued ritual/religious roles traditionally fulfilled by some of these groups. However, the breakdown of the traditional communities and their original forms of social organization tends to result in the loss of these integrative aspects, while the negative stigma typically remains.

Poverty

55. As a consequence of the marginalization of discrimination against these communities, they are typically among the economically poorest in their respective societies. In some cases, such as that of the Watta, the stigma of poverty can itself be said to be a cause of the discrimination against these communities.

Violence

56. In many of the described cases, efforts by members of the affected communities to improve their status and social conditions and to assert their rights have been met by violence. This is particularly well documented in the case of the Dalits of India,⁸ but also seems to be the case in respect of a number of the other communities mentioned.

III. CONCLUSIONS

57. It is apparent to the authors of this expanded working paper that the prevalence of discrimination based on work and descent is more widespread than might have been envisaged at the outset of this process. The authors believe that further examination will reveal still further examples of affected communities.

58. This form of discrimination is distinct, in its combination of causal factors and expressions, from other forms of discrimination examined in the history of the Sub-Commission. Not all of these causal factors and expressions are present, or present to the same degree or in the same combinations, in each of the cases described. However, the authors consider that this form of discrimination, based particularly on work (or occupational role) and descent, requires much closer examination and attention both by national Governments and by the international human rights system, given the numbers of people affected and the extreme nature of many of the discriminatory attitudes and practices associated with it.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

59. Taking into account the important work already done by CERD in setting out measures for States under their obligation to eliminate discrimination based on descent, the main function of the Sub-Commission could be to proceed further with the investigation of situations in which such discrimination occurs. Accordingly, the authors make the following recommendations for further examination of and attention to this issue.

60. The Sub-Commission should consider mandating a third working paper on remaining issues identified in this expanded working paper, including in particular a review of existing constitutional, legislative and administrative measures for the abolition of such discrimination, and based on dialogue with and responses from Governments.

61. The Sub-Commission should consider, either as an alternative to or upon the conclusion of any such third working paper, proposing a study for the purpose of drafting a set of principles and guidelines for the effective elimination of discrimination based on work and descent (and/or a declaration on discrimination based on work and descent for possible adoption by the General Assembly), in consultation with CERD, the International Labour Organization, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and other relevant United Nations agencies, as well as with Governments and non-governmental organizations.

62. **The Sub-Commission should consider inviting UNESCO, the United Nations Research Institute for Social Development and other relevant United Nations agencies to undertake research in order to more comprehensively review the incidence and governmental response to discrimination based on work and descent.**
63. **The Sub-Commission should consider proposing that a seminar be convened on this topic, involving Sub-Commission members, CERD members, members of other relevant treaty bodies, Governments, relevant United Nations agencies, the World Bank and other international and regional development organizations, and non-governmental organizations, in order to provide a basis for drafting the proposed principles and guidelines (and/or declaration) on the elimination of discrimination based on work and descent.**
64. **The Sub-Commission should consider recommending to the Commission on Human Rights that its relevant special mechanisms (in particular the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the Special Rapporteur on adequate housing) should be requested to pay attention in the fulfilment of their mandates to the situation of communities affected by discrimination based on work and descent.**
65. **The Sub-Commission should consider recommending to the High Commissioner for Human Rights that the issue of discrimination based on work and descent should be addressed in the activities of his Office, including in the sphere of technical assistance and advisory services.**
66. **The Sub-Commission should consider recommending that relevant Governments:**
- (a) Disseminate widely CERD general recommendation XXIX on descent-based discrimination and implement its recommendations;**
 - (b) Take appropriate measures, or strengthen existing measures - constitutional, legislative and administrative - to effectively prohibit and eliminate discrimination based on work and descent;**
 - (c) Provide adequate remedies, including compensation, for victims of discrimination based on work and descent;**
 - (d) Establish, where not already in place, appropriate affirmative action mechanisms for members of the affected communities, especially in the fields of education and employment; and**
 - (e) Implement public awareness-raising and education campaigns, to promote positive change in public attitudes and practices vis-à-vis members of communities affected by discrimination based on work and descent.**

Notes

¹ Including, according to Tamari (1994), “les Mandingues, les Soninké, les Wolof, les Peuls, les Toucouleur, les Songhay, les Sénoufo, les Dogon, les Touaregs et les Maures”.

² Mali, Mauritania, Senegal, Gambia, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, northern Côte D’Ivoire, Burkina Faso, Niger, eastern Ghana, part of the Algerian Sahara, some places in northern Cameroon, Liberia and Sierra Leone (according to Tamari (1994)).

³ www.undp.org.ye/Inequalities.htm, accessed 9 May 2003.

⁴ M.H. Hashem, *Goals for social integration and realities of social exclusions in the Republic of Yemen* (International Institute for Labour Studies, Geneva, 1996), p. 73.

⁵ For example, Kupoluyi, article in *Punch* (Nigeria), 10 January 1996; T. Agbaegbu, “Slavery in Igboland” and “Moves to Stop Slavery in Igboland”, News Watch Online, 12 January 2000; A. Agbo, “Citizens of a Strange Class” *Tell*, 6 May 2002; T. Okoli, “Fear of the Unknown Hits the World”, *This Day* (Lagos), 9 May 2003 (available online at <http://allafrica.com/stories/200305090543.html>).

⁶ R. Lee, “The Rom-Vlach Gypsies and the Kris-Romani” (1997) *American Journal of Comparative Law*, vol. 45, 1997, pp. 369-370.

⁷ For example, L.D. Alldritt, “The Burakumin: The Complicity of Japanese Buddhism in Oppression and an Opportunity for Liberation”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, vol. 7, 2000 (available online at <http://jbe.gold.ac.uk/7/alldritt001.html>).

⁸ See e.g. Human Rights Watch, *Broken People: Cast Violence Against India’s “Untouchables”*, Human Rights Watch, New York, 1999.

ANNEX

Selected bibliography

I. GENERAL

Human Rights Watch, *Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern* (New York, Human Rights Watch, 2001).

A. Stevens, "Discrimination Based on Descent in Africa" August 2002 (available on the web site of the International Dalit Solidarity Network: www.dalitfreedom.org).

A. Tuden & L. Plotnicov (eds), *Social Stratification in Africa* (New York, The Free Press, 1970).

II. ENDOGAMOUS OCCUPATIONAL GROUPS IN WEST AFRICA (BLACKSMITHS, POTTERS, *GRIOTS*, etc.)

O. P. Gosselain, "Castes, Pottery Technology and Historical Processes in the Mande Area, West Africa", unpublished manuscript.

S. Kaba, *Les droits de l'homme au Sénégal* (Dakar, Collection Xaam Sa Yoon, 1997).

P. Mbow, "Democratie, droits humains et castes au Sénégal" (2000) *Journal des Africanistes* 70(1-2) 32-71.

P. McNaughton, *The Mande Blacksmiths: Knowledge, Power and Art in West Africa* (Indianapolis, Indiana University Press, 1993 [1988]).

J. Sterner, *The Ways of the Mandara Mountains: A comparative regional approach*, PhD thesis, SOAS, University of London, 1998.

J. Sterner & N. David, "Gender and Caste in the Mandara Highlands: Northeastern Nigeria and Northern Cameroon" (1991) *Ethnology* 30(4) 355-369.

T. Tamari, *Les castes de l'Afrique occidentale* (Nanterre, University of Paris, 1994).

T. Tamari, "The Development of Caste Systems in West Africa" (1991) *Journal of African History* 32(2) 221-250.

NGO submissions to CERD thematic discussion (August 2002) from Senegal, Niger and Guinea (available on the website of the International Dalit Solidarity Network: www.dalitfreedom.org).

III. GROUPS IN NORTH-EAST AFRICA (THE DIME AND OTHERS)

H. S. Lewis, "Wealth, Influence, and Prestige Among the Shoa Galla" in A. Tuden & L. Plotnicov (eds), *Social Stratification in Africa* (New York, The Free Press, 1970) 163-186.

A. Pankhurst “‘Caste’ in Africa: The Evidence from South-western Ethiopia Reconsidered” (1999) 69(1) Africa 485.

D. Todd, “Caste in Africa” (1977) 47 Africa (4), 389-412.

IV. THE WATTA: FORMER HUNTER-GATHERERS OF NORTH-EAST AFRICA

I. K. Galgallo, “Minority Rights or Rights of Vulnerable Groups”, Submission presented to the Constitution of Kenya Review Commission on 21 May 2002 at Isiolo Town, Kenya.

A. Kassam, “When Will We be People as Well? Social Identity and the Politics of Cultural Performance: The Case of the Waata Oromo of East and Northeast Africa” (2000) Social Identities 6(2) 189-206.

A. Kassam & A.B. Bashuna, “The predicament of the Waata, former hunter-gathers of East and Northeast Africa: etic and emic perspectives”, paper presented to Ninth International Conference on Hunting and Gathering Societies (CHAGS 9), Edinburgh, 2002.

NGO submission to CERD thematic discussion (August 2002) on the descent-based discrimination in Kenya (available on the website of the International Dalit Solidarity Network: www.dalitfreedom.org).

V. SOMALI SAB GROUPS (MIDGAN-MADIBHAN, TUMAL AND YIBIR)

Danish Immigration Service (Udlaendingestyrelsen), United Kingdom Home Office, and Dutch Immigration Service (Ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken), Report on Minority Groups in Somalia - Joint British, Danish and Dutch fact-finding mission to Nairobi, Kenya, 17 to 24 September 2000 (Copenhagen, Denmark, December 2000), p. 125.

NGO submission to CERD thematic discussion (August 2002) on Somali outcast groups (available on the website of the International Dalit Solidarity Network: www.dalitfreedom.org).

VI. AKHDAM OF YEMEN

M. H. Hashem, *Goals for social integration and realities of social exclusions in the Republic of Yemen* (Geneva, International Institute for Labour Studies, 1996).

Delores M. Walters, “Transforming Cultural, Racial and Gender Categories: An Ethnographic Update on Social Relations in Two Northern Yemeni Communities”, *Yemen Update* 37 (1995): 6-9; www.aiys.org/webdate/abs.html.

“The Sweepers: Fighting Centuries Old Isolation”, *Yemen Times* 10(36), 4-10 September 2000; www.yementimes.com/00/iss36/culture.htm.

VII. OSU OF IGBOLAND

V. E. Dike, *The Osu Caste System in Igboland: A Challenge for Nigerian Democracy* (Kearney NE, Morris Publishing, 2002).

G. I. Nwaka, "The Civil Rights Movement in Colonial Igboland" (1985) *International Journal of African Historical Studies* 18(3) 473-485.

NGO submission to CERD thematic discussion (August 2002) on the Osu caste system in Nigeria (available on the website of the International Dalit Solidarity Network: www.dalitfreedom.org).

VIII. OTHER SPECIFIC COMMUNITIES

L.D. Alldritt, "The *Burakumin*: The Complicity of Japanese Buddhism in Oppression and an Opportunity for Liberation" (2000) *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 7 (available online at <http://jbe.gold.ac.uk/7/alldritt001.html>).

J. B. Cornell, "'Caste' in Japanese Social Stratification: A Theory and a Case" (1970) *Monumenta Nipponica* 25(1/2), pp. 107-135.

Human Rights Watch, *Broken People: Caste Violence Against India's "Untouchables"* (New York, Human Rights Watch, 1999).

R. Lee, "The Rom-Vlach Gypsies and the Kris-Romani" (1997) 45 *American Journal of Comparative Law*, pp. 345, 369-370.
